

**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

1. Agenda Approval

Changes or additions to the agenda.

**BOARD ACTION**

I move to approve the agenda as posted.

2. Minutes Approval

**BOARD ACTION**

I move to approve the minutes for the October 18-19, 2023 Regular Board meeting, and the November 13, 2023 Special Board meeting.

3. Rolling Calendar

**BOARD ACTION**

I move to set December 18, 2024, as the date for the December 2024 regularly scheduled Board Meeting, to occur via videoconference originating from the Office of the State Board of Education in Boise.

**BOARDWORK  
DECEMBER 13, 2023**

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**



**STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING  
October 18-19, 2023  
Lewis-Clark State College  
Williams Conference Center  
801-899 4th Street Lewiston, ID 83501**

A regular meeting of the Idaho State Board of Education was held at Lewis-Clark State College on October 18-19, 2023. Board President Dr. Linda Clark called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. (PT).

**Present**

Dr. Linda Clark, President	Kurt Liebich
William G. Gilbert, Jr. Vice-President	Cindy Siddoway
Debbie Critchfield, Secretary	Cally Roach

**Absent**

Dr. David Hill	Shawn Keough
----------------	--------------

**Wednesday, October 18, 2023 – 9:00 a.m. (Pacific Time)**

**BOARDWORK**

1. Agenda Review and Approval – Action Item

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Gilbert / Roach) I move to approve the agenda as posted.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0. Dr. David Hill and Shawn Keough were absent from voting.

2. Minutes Review and Approval – Action Item

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Gilbert / Critchfield) I move to approve the minutes for the August 23, 2023 regular Board meeting.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0. Dr. David Hill and Shawn Keough were absent from voting.

3. Rolling Calendar – Action Item

**BOARD ACTION**

**BOARDWORK  
DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

**M/S (Gilbert / Roach) I move to set June 11, 2024 as the date and Idaho State University as the location for the Chief Executive Officers' annual performance evaluations.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0. Dr. David Hill and Shawn Keough were absent from voting.

**AND**

**M/S (Gilbert / Roach) I move to set June 12-13, 2024 as the date and Idaho State University as the location for the June 2024 regularly scheduled Board Meeting.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0. Dr. David Hill and Shawn Keough were absent from voting.

**AND**

**M/S (Gilbert / Roach) I move to set October 16-17, 2024, as the date and Lewis-Clark State College as the location for the October 2024 regularly scheduled Board meeting.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0. Dr. David Hill and Shawn Keough were absent from voting.

**CONSENT**

**BAHR**

1. University of Idaho – Multi-Year Employment Contract - Head Men’s Basketball Coach – Action Item

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Gilbert / Siddoway) I move to approve the University of Idaho’s request to enter into a five (5) year employment agreement with Alex Pribble, Men’s Basketball Team Head Coach in substantial conformance with the form submitted to the Board as Attachment 1.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0. Dr. David Hill and Shawn Keough were absent from voting.

2. University of Idaho – Multi-Year Employment Contract - Head Women’s Basketball Coach – Action Item

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Gilbert / Siddoway) I move to approve the University of Idaho’s request to enter into a five (5) year employment agreement with Carrie Eighmey, Women’s Basketball Team Head Coach in substantial conformance with the form submitted to the Board as Attachment 1.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0. Dr. David Hill and Shawn Keough were absent from voting.

**PPGA**

3. Data Management Council Appointments – Action Item

**BOARDWORK  
DECEMBER 13, 2023**

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Gilbert / Siddoway) I move to approve the appointment of William Goodman to the Data Management Council as the K-12 urban district representative commencing immediately and ending June 30, 2024.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0. Dr. David Hill and Shawn Keough were absent from voting.

**AND**

**M/S (Gilbert / Siddoway) I move to approve the appointment of Dr. Scott Woolstenhulme to the Data Management Council as the K-12 at-large district representative commencing immediately and ending June 30, 2024.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0. Dr. David Hill and Shawn Keough were absent from voting.

4. Idaho State Rehabilitation Council Membership – Action Item

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Gilbert / Siddoway) I move to re-appoint Randi Cole as a representative of the Client Assistant Program for a three-year term, effective immediately through October 18, 2026.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0. Dr. David Hill and Shawn Keough were absent from voting.

5. CTE Limited Occupational Specialist Certificate Extension – Action Item

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Gilbert / Siddoway) I move to approve the request by the Division of Career Technical Education to waive the three-year limit of the interim certificate in IDAPA 08.02.02.015.04.C. for one year for Brian Krupp.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0. Dr. David Hill and Shawn Keough were absent from voting.

6. CTE Postsecondary Credentialing Manual – Action Item

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Gilbert / Siddoway) I move to approve the Postsecondary Credentialing Manual as amended in Attachment 1.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0. Dr. David Hill and Shawn Keough were absent from voting.

**SDE**

7. Emergency Provisional Certificate Recommendations – Action Item

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Gilbert / Siddoway) I move to authorize the State Department of Education to issue emergency provisional certificates for candidates 1-16 as presented above,**

**BOARDWORK  
DECEMBER 13, 2023**

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

**effective for the 2023-2024 school year only and pending a cleared background check.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0. Dr. David Hill and Shawn Keough were absent from voting.

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Gilbert / Siddoway) I move to approve the consent agenda.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0. Dr. David Hill and Shawn Keough were absent from voting.

**PLANNING, POLICY AND GOVERNMENTAL AFFAIRS**

1. Lewis Clark State College Annual Report - Information Item

Before beginning, Dr. Pemberton, President, Lewis Clark State College, took a moment to remind everyone present that today we are gathering in Simínekem, the indigenous homeland of the Nimiipuu - Nez Perce Tribe, and she acknowledged the Nimiipuu as the original caretakers of this land since time immemorial and recognized their continuing connection to the land, to the water, and to their ancestors.

She then shared the following:

- LCSC is a 130-year-old campus, the second oldest in the State, and is Idaho's small college public school experience connecting college to career and learning to earning overall.
- LCSC students are Idaho residents. They come from nearly every county in the state. The native population of students is up 6%. Veteran students are up 25%. This year there is an overwhelmingly large number of first-generation students who are all Pell eligible. A review of the demographics of current students show that the vast majority of them work while they're going to school, many of them full time. LCSC's post-graduation rates, meaning an individual, is either reporting that they are working or that they're in grad school or they're going to the military post graduation are 98% CTE and 99% academic.
- In the spring of 2020 LCSC had to either cut or reduce projected expenditures by 5 million dollars. That's 14% of appropriated money or 70% of salaries.
- The majority of LCSC students come from within 150 to 200-mile radius of campus.
- Some of the challenges LCSC faces include: high school enrollments are declining; the local population base is not growing; and there is competition from local two-year community colleges who are offering select bachelor's of applied science degrees, but where possible LCSC is partnering with them.
- Also being monitored is the conversation surrounding the University of Phoenix purchase and BYU Idaho's moving forward with offering a 3-year bachelor's degree.

**BOARDWORK  
DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

- LCSC is becoming a full-time residential campus, with housing being maxed out for the second year in a row. Full-time enrollment is nearing 50%. The average age of an LCSC student is 23.
- LCSC's workforce training program last year served 3,700 students through 4,525 courses. LCSC's GED program now has 92 students.

Dr. Andy Hanson, Vice President for Student Affairs, Lewis Clark State College continued the annual report by sharing the following.

- To combat the declining enrollment from area high schools LCSC is reaching out to students in neighboring states such as Alaska, Hawaii, North Dakota and others. LCSC has added recruitment staff with a consistent presence at both the College of Southern Idaho and the College of Eastern Idaho as well as in regional high schools.
- LCSC is also going into the area middle schools to bring information about LCSC to a younger generation of student.

Dr. Pemberton continued.

- This summer LCSC's welding students, working with the Idaho Department of Parks and Recreation, revitalized benches in Hills Gate State Park, and the outdoor program put together a pop-up equipment rental for the State Park this last summer.
- Orofino Second Chance Pell now has 63 students enrolled; Juvenile Corrections has 16 students, and Adult Ed (Portfolio Program) has 18 students. In 20/21 there was 1 student enrolled.
- According to Nurse.org LCSC has, for the second year in a row, the #1 nursing program in the country, offering nursing education through certificate, bachelors and graduate programs.
- LCSC is developing a critical care and operating room nursing certificate program and revitalizing their associate pathways in physical therapy, occupational therapy, respiratory therapy surge tech.
- LCSC has 20 online degrees available and they were the first institution to fully implement and articulate through Online Idaho.

Mr. Gilbert asked about LCSC's program prioritization and what can the Board expect concerning budget setting and cost projections in setting these prioritizations. Dr. Pemberton said that while she did not have actual numbers yet to discuss, LCSC will move forward with the intent that there will be outcomes that further improve LCSC's ability to be effective and efficient.

Mr. Liebich asked about the decline in CTE enrollment and if she knew what was causing this decline. Dr. Pemberton said while the data surrounding this decline is still being researched she can report that the average age of a CTE student is dropping; that the typical CTE student is a full-time student; that the economy may be playing a

**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

part in the lower enrollment numbers as students are able to go directly into the job market.

Mrs. Roach asked Dr. Pemberton for her thoughts on perhaps having the program prioritization process happen more often than every 5 years, and what are the top 5 program disciplines that LCSC specializes in. Dr. Pemberton said she did not believe the program prioritization process should be done more often since it is such an arduous process and doing it on a faster basis might not yield more meaningful information. As for the LCSC program specialties she listed nursing, health care education, teacher education, strong liberal arts and science programs and professional studies programs.

Mrs. Roach alluded to Dr. Pemberton's presentation and she asked if upon her entering LCSC as President did she need to cut programs. Dr. Pemberton said she not only had to cut programs but also staff, which LCSC is still recovering from.

Superintendent Critchfield asked Dr. Pemberton if she could elaborate on the high marks LCSC gets from organizations around the country. Dr. Pemberton said she believes it is LCSC's small school experience that has a big impact on students particularly with the student demographic. Students are names, not numbers, the students know their faculty and the faculty know the students, that they are in classrooms with their counterparts on a regular basis, and that LCSC incorporates alternative ways to reach students to move them along.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

**LEWIS CLARK STATE COLLEGE BOARD OF TRUSTEES**  
**LEWIS CLARK STATE COLLEGE COMMUNITY FORUM**

1. Lewis Clark State College Students address the Board

The following LCSC students addressed the Board; Xander McDowell, Estefanny Alvarado, Trent Charlton, Alexandrah Crow, Caden Freeman, Matt Blanford, Melanie Spicer, Logan Haley.

Superintendent Critchfield asked the students what went into their decision to come to LCSC. One student said a big factor in choosing LCSC was the small school feel. During high school counselors tried to impress upon the students that going to college would be a big change because they would be in classroom sizes of upwards of 200 students in certain classes. Choosing LCSC was an easy decision because they could have more one on one time with instructors and being in classroom environments where it felt like they were more than just a number, more than a student. They were treated as a person, and that's something that they really valued.



**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

Another student said it was how much the staff care about the students that made the difference. He is doing things he did not know he would be capable of and it all came from the support he's received from the staff.

Another student said it was the reputation of LCSC in the community which led him to enroll. He wanted a school that would enhance his welding skills. Along with the great connection with his welding professors and the higher-level courses he is able to take he has been pushed beyond what he already knew about welding. LCSC is also one of the few schools that actually offer a degree on a CTE program.

One student mentioned the close tie with North Idaho College which is allowing him to get his bachelor of science degree while taking community college courses which make going to school more affordable.

Board President Dr. Linda Clark asked how many students took dual credit courses, how many credits did they take and did they feel it made a difference to their education. Some of the answers shared were; one student took 23 credits. One took 46 credits mostly in computer science and most of them transferred over. Another student had credits numbering in the low 30's with credits from BSU, CWI and NNU which took care of his first semester of course work.

Mr. Gilbert asked if the students felt that the community at large had a clear understanding of what LCSC had to offer to folks in mid-career or as adult learners. And how would they get the word out about what LCSC has to offer. The students said that growing partnerships with area businesses would help to get the word out. The example given was that with the outreach to the prison population the staff of the prison have expressed an interest in attending classes as well.

Mrs. Roach asked how can we improve the go on rate? How can we encourage people, high school students specifically, to understand the importance of higher education, and did anyone have any ideas they could share with the Board? The students said it was very important for high school students to see students succeeding at LCSC; the campus tours given to high school students are very important in giving them a clear look at what attending LCSC would be like. One student sat on a student panel from his high school and so many of the students recognized him from his days in high school and seeing him doing so well at LCSC they were able to envision what the possibilities could be for themselves one day.

Mr. Liebich asked if the students felt prepared for college life when they first arrived on campus. The students shared that even though high school tries to prepare you for college life it was the support from the LCSC faculty and staff that was the biggest adjustment. In high school you are told that you will have to be self-sufficient but that wasn't the case at LCSC.



**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

Board President Dr. Clark asked the students to share their insight into the following; within the next few months the State Department and the State Board will be jointly working on a revision of the high school graduation requirements. From the current graduation requirements what was not particularly useful to you, and what should be required that would have better prepared you for your college experience. The students said they felt very prepared. They would encourage high school students to take English, science and math classes to have the fundamentals of each in place because that knowledge will help them with their general ed courses in college. Having a course in how to apply for college and even how to apply for scholarships would be helpful for high school seniors.

Dr. Clark asked for a show of hands; how many of their high schools had a college / career counselor who was separate from their regular counselor? The answer was 2.

At this time the Board took a 10-minute break returning at 10:40 a.m. (PT).

2. Lewis Clark State College Employees address the Board

The following LCSC faculty / staff addressed the Board; Kim Tuschhoff, Rachel Peasley, Dr. Seth Bradshaw, Dr. Jeff Ober, Lonny Gehring, Doug Cruthirds, Ty Graham, Dr. Nina Peterson, Dr. Nancy Johnson, Dr. Krista Harwick, Chelsea Cronin, Con Schafman.

Mr. Liebich asked the teachers if they collaborate with businesses in the community and are they meeting the local communities needs? One instructor said there is a local business who needed welders and they set up a shift that went from 4:00 - 9:00 p.m. to accommodate some of the student's schedules. There are currently 5-6 students working for them pretty much full time now.

Another teacher shared that from the health professions aspect LCSC has a very collaborative relationship with the clinical partners in the area. Whether that's Lewiston, Clarkston, Moscow, Pullman, or all the way up to Coeur d'Alene, LCSC works with clinical agencies of all sorts, inpatient acute care, population, health centers, etc. There are plenty of clinical opportunities for students with the hope that this will lead to employment when the students graduate.

Through workforce training LCSC holds several meetings almost monthly with business partners to discuss the training being provided to students to make sure it is aligning with the business communities needs. Over the last two years the Idaho Cyberdome has employed students all throughout the State. About 20 students are currently working or have worked for them on 6-month rotations. The students monitor cyber activities for small nonprofits throughout the State, while getting real world hands-on experience all while helping these businesses that otherwise would not be able to monitor for cyber activities on their own.

**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

Mr. Gilbert asked if they believed that the community, and the surrounding areas, understood the scope of what LCSC has to offer, and if not, why not. The teachers shared that this seems to be an ongoing issue. One of the things they have found when out talking with community and business groups is, they know their own business, but they have no idea what anybody's else's business needs because they don't need to. When local business is asked how many career technical programs does LCSC offer no one knows the answer. Their knowledge ends at the door of their own business. LCSC's counselors are beginning to talk with every ninth grader in the community to let them know what programs LCSC has to offer and what career opportunities exist with that training in the local area.

Another approach LCSC recently began was to go into the new Career Technical Centers and ask them directly, what are you having problems with, how can we help you? The answer was they really wanted an introduction to CTE course offered to the ninth graders, so LCSC reached out to the high school counselors who said they would make this intro to CTE course mandatory for ninth graders. Starting this fall every ninth grader at Lewiston High School is required to take this course. There are now also two full-time people who spend half their time at the high school telling students about the careers and the CTE pathways that are available in the valley.

Mr. Freeman asked the teachers for their perspective on whether the students entering LCSC were college ready when they arrived. The teachers said this was a mixed set of answers. Some students attend LCSC because they are intimidated to attend a larger institution, or they need extra support. And then there are those students who come in with 20, 30 and even 40 dual credits who are ready to go, who have a clear vision of their future.

Another instructor mentioned that for those students who take dual credit math courses they seem to be a little better prepared for taking certain courses.

Mrs. Roach asked if anyone had any comments or stories about any of the students or families that had been changed by the work they do. One teacher shared that she had a student named Damian who was in the foster care program and who was never sure of what his academic path was going to be. He tried several schools before coming to LCSC; dropped out for a while then thought he wanted to be a teacher, then a chemist. He is now getting his PhD in chemistry and all because while at LCSC a teacher asked him to become a teaching assistant and that was the moment he decided to stay in school and get his degree.

There was a student who graduated from the welding program a few years ago and he got a job right away. Over the summer he reached out and told his teacher that he was applying for a teaching job at Prairie High School. He finished his Bachelor's degree

**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

and now he's a direct source of students because he knows how to prepare them for the welding program at LCSC.

A student that LCSC had graduated last year, came in as a career technical student. He was in web development, a non-traditional student. He had his ideas of what he wanted to do. He was going to get his web development degree and then he was going to get a job working remotely. He got his web development degree, took some computer science classes, and he was talked into continuing his education and getting a computer science degree, which he did. And he ended up getting his dream job. He is doing website development for the US mint from the comfort of his home.

Mr. Liebich asked if from their perspective were there any issues this Board needed to be addressing that would support them, and LCSC. Mr. Gilbert joined in and added a second question asking what did they see as the existential threat to LCSC over the next year and how does the Board get ahead of that. In answer to this question the teachers said substantial change would need to take place specifically as it pertains to having to run new ideas through so many working groups which slows the process for change down. One of the references they made was to a program called Idaho's Future where advisors at colleges would go into high schools talking about college readiness. With Idaho's Future students who were taking dual credits were going to get assistance from a college advisor to see how the dual credits they were taking would affect their degree goals. However, the program stopped during COVID and has never returned. Because of this, teachers are seeing students with high numbers of dual credits coming into LCSC but not all of those credits can be used for anything more than electives. Having help for dual credit students as to what the credits they are taking will do for them before they take them would be very helpful.

Rural school students often do not have the same opportunities to take science or math dual credit courses as the urban students do. The schools do not have qualified teachers who can teach these courses and more importantly they do not have the equipment necessary to offer these courses to the students. So we need creative ways to get rural students the same opportunities.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

**PLANNING, POLICY AND GOVERNMENTAL AFFAIRS**

**2. Lewis Clark State College Educator Preparation Program Update**

Fred Chilson, Provost and Vice-President of Academic Affairs, and Dr. Royal Toy, Director of the Pathways for Accelerated Certification and Endorsement, Lewis Clark State College addressed the Board sharing the following concerning the Educator Preparation Program. They imparted the following;

**BOARDWORK  
DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

- Just prior to the outbreak of COVID the LCSC online elementary program went fully online with 19 students. This past semester there are now 60 students enrolled.
- LCSC also offers post baccalaureate programs typically for secondary education. They courses are delivered online.
- Through the PACE program, which is a cohort-based program that allows accelerated pathways for individuals that begin in a summer and they continue classes online and face to face throughout the rest of the year and then typically do their teacher internship either in the fall or spring.
- Via the mastery-based pathway, an alternative authorization or a non-traditional pathway depending on how the candidates progress, students have to meet the requirements of being a content specialist. But first they must have a bachelor's degree, then they complete modules that are ongoing enrollment, meaning they can enroll in any month of the year, and they can work up to a full calendar year to complete each module separately.
- LCSC engages candidates as early as possible in having clinical experiences, getting them into actual classrooms where they can teach and co-teach with teachers that are in the current programs they would like to teach themselves.
- Each student is assigned a faculty mentor who goes into the classroom and mentors with them.
- LCSC's faculty work at ensuring that they are minimizing the cost to the students themselves by trying to have open educational resources available or not requiring textbooks, and instead using practical application and engagement as the methodology for instruction.

Mr. Liebich asked about the Mastery Based Program and how Dr. Toy mentioned that it had grown faster than expected. He wondered how many students are in the program? Dr. Toy said since the program began they have graduated 33 students with another 33 actively engaged in courses right now and another 20 that are in the application process.

Superintendent Critchfield shared the following; over the past 10 months specifically she has heard from teachers and they agree that mentoring of new teachers is key to their success in the classroom; learning how to manage a classroom environment is important and should be taught; being taught how to engage and talk with parents would be helpful; and finally, how we are preparing teachers to teach reading is very important to student success. The Superintendent stressed the need to use the 5 Elements of the Science of Reading. Dr. Toy said they are using the 5 Elements to teach best practices in teaching reading. They offer 5 courses in the elementary program and 5 courses in developmental reading. Because there is no silver bullet in getting students to read; it comes down to the teacher, and how well the teacher has been prepared to teach the 5 elements.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

**BOARDWORK  
DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

**BUSINESS AFFAIRS AND HUMAN RESOURCES**

1. Board Policy II.P. – General Policies and Procedures – All Employees - Second Reading

Patrick Coulson, Chief Financial Officer, Idaho State Board of Education, reminded the Board that Board Policy II.P. outlines the General Policies and Procedures applicable to all employees. At the April 2023 Board Meeting, the Board directed staff to bring an amendment to Board Policy regarding Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion statements for review not later than the August 2023 Board Meeting. Proposed amendments to the policy will add a new subsection under Section II.P.5 – Miscellaneous Policies and Procedures. The new subsection h. mirrors the language of the Board’s resolution.

This proposed policy amendment fulfills the Board’s direction to staff to develop a proposed amendment to Board Policy codifying the principles of the April 2023 resolution Prohibiting Use of Diversity Statements in Hiring and Promoting an Environment of Belonging for All Students at Public Postsecondary Institutions. A draft of this new amendment has been vetted through the BAHR Committee at its August 9, 2023 meeting and the Board approved the first reading of the proposed amendment of II.P. at its August 23, 2023 meeting.

There were no changes between the first and second reading.

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Gilbert / Liebich) I move to approve the second reading of proposed amendments to Policy II.P. as provided in Attachment 1.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0. Dr. David Hill and Shawn Keough were absent from voting.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

2. Board Policy V.K. - Construction Projects - Second Reading

Mr. Coulson said the changes primarily consist of increasing delegated authority approval limits authorized by a Local Agency or the Board’s executive director. These higher limits pertain to Original Project Costs, Cumulative Value of Change(s), and Aggregate Revised Project Costs. Increasing these limits appropriately reflects changes in the construction industry over the past eight years. The previous revision of this policy dates back to August 2015.

The modifications to this policy were vetted through the BAHR Committee at its August 9, 2023 meeting and the Board approved the first reading of the proposed updates at its August 23, 2023 meeting.

**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

There were no changes between first and second reading.

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Gilbert / Roach) I move to approve the second reading of proposed amendments to Policy V.K. as provided in Attachment 1.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0. Dr. David Hill and Shawn Keough were absent from voting.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

3. BAHR Committee Priorities and Initiative

Mr. Matt Freeman, Executive Director, Idaho State Board of Education was asked to provide introductory overview. He said Board bylaws establish three standing committees: Business Affairs and Human Resources (BAHR), Instruction, Research and Student Affairs (IRSA), and Planning, Policy, and Government Affairs (PPGA). In the fall of 2020, each committee established long term initiatives and priorities. The Board committees have been asked to review and update their initiatives and priorities to ensure continued alignment with Governor Little's education priorities as well as the Board's strategic plan.

Updating these key objectives will help the committees clearly understand its direction and maintain momentum in achieving strategic priorities of the Board for 2023-2024.

Over the past few months, the BAHR Committee chair has worked collaboratively with Board staff to develop these priorities for the next fiscal year accompanied with well-defined anticipated outcomes. This will provide higher-level guidance in addition to the primary responsibilities of the BAHR Committee.

In order to move to a more strategic approach, on September 7, 2023, the BAHR Committee Initiatives and Priorities were discussed and reviewed by the BAHR Chair and Board staff to set the two primary initiatives delineated in Attachment 1. The initiatives will focus the BAHR committee's direction for both the short and long term and provide context for agenda items that will be presented to the Board. While this document is one that can be adjusted and continuously improved upon, the desired outcomes will result in foundational groundwork for the strategic work being undertaken by the committee. This information was shared and considered with the BAHR Committee on October 4, 2023.

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Gilbert / Siddoway) I move to approve the BAHR Committee Initiatives and Priorities for 2023-2024 as submitted in Attachment 1.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 6-0. Dr. David Hill and Shawn Keough were absent from voting.



**BOARDWORK  
DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

At this time the Board took a 1-hour break returning at 12:50 p.m. (PT).

Board member Shawn Keough was recognized as being present.

**PLANNING, POLICY, AND GOVERNMENTAL AFFAIRS**

3. Board Policy IV.D. – Educator Preparation and Certification – First Reading

Jenn Thompson, Chief Policy and Government Affairs Officer, Idaho State Board of Education, said IDAPA 08.02.03.128 establishes the structure of curricular materials review committees. Review of curricular materials, also facilitated by the State Department of Education, is to take place in the year following content standards review. The language defining the structure of these committees provides additional flexibility and has not presented an implementation problem to date.

Attachment 1 proposes revisions to Board Policy IV.D. that aligns the language in policy pertaining to content standards review committees with the existing language in IDAPA 08.02.03.128 pertaining to curricular materials review committees.

In addition to this change, a technical correction is proposed in paragraph 2.ff. of Board Policy IV.D. for the purpose of removing a no longer relevant reference to grades 5-9.

Updating Section 1.a.i of Board Policy IV.D. to materially align with IDAPA 02.02.03.128, would provide the SDE with the necessary flexibility to establish effective content review committees. This change would also further align administrative rule and Board policy and would serve to streamline the workload for the SDE staff that facilitate both Content Standards and Curricular Materials committees.

This is a first reading.

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Liebich / Siddoway) I move to approve the first read of proposed revisions to Board Policy IV.D. as presented in Attachment 1.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 7-0. Dr. David Hill was absent from voting.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

4. Board Policy I.K – Naming and Memorializing Buildings – Second Reading

Ms. Thompson reminded the Board that this was a second reading and the proposed amendment adds a new section, 1.c., which would allow a facility to be named for an



**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

individual or an entity that has contracted with the institution to purchase the naming rights of the facility.

There were no changes between first and second reading.

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Liebich / Roach) I move to approve the proposed revisions to Board Policy I.K. Naming/Memorializing Building and Facilities.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 7-0. Dr. David Hill was absent from voting.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

5. Temporary Rule Docket No.: 08-0113-2303 - Rules Governing Opportunity Scholarship

Ms. Thompson reminded the Board that during the 2023 legislative session, the Idaho Launch Grant Program was created by House Bill 24 and Senate Bill 1167 and codified at Idaho Code § 77-1205. These bills also amended Idaho Code § 33-4303, regarding the Idaho Opportunity Scholarship.

Changes made to Idaho Code § 33-4303 removed community colleges from the definition of institutions eligible to receive funds from this scholarship. The Governor approved the Board's promulgation of the temporary rule adopted by the Board in June of 2023 which stated that "The board may not award any new (opportunity) scholarship, excluding renewals, to any student attending community college on or after July 1, 2023." The proposed rule adopted by the Board at its August meeting removed continuing eligibility credit hour requirements which pertain to community colleges. Because students who were awarded the scholarship prior to July 1, 2023, remain eligible to use the scholarship to attend community college, it is necessary to reinstate eligibility requirements at community college.

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Liebich / Siddoway) I move to approve the Temporary Rule Docket 08-0113-2303, as presented in Attachment 1, effective November 1, 2023, and expiring upon the legislature adjourning sine die at the conclusion of the 2024 legislative session, contingent on approval to promulgate the temporary rule by the Governor.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 7-0. Dr. David Hill was absent from voting.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

6. Recommended Procedures for Emergency Provisional Certifications

**BOARDWORK  
DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

Ms. Thompson said Idaho Code § 33-1201 requires that every person who is employed to serve in any elementary or secondary school in as a “teacher, supervisor, administrator, education specialist, school nurse or school librarian” “to hold a certificate issued under authority of the state board of education, valid for the service being rendered.” Idaho Code § 33-1203 allows the State Board of Education to authorize a provisional certificate for teachers when the candidate has at least two years of college training and an emergency has been declared. This section of Code does not authorize issuance of emergency provisional certificates for pupil service staff or administrators.

School districts receive the same level of funding for staff with an emergency provisional certificate as they receive for an individual with a standard certificate. Funding for long-term substitutes is at the same level as non-certified classified staff.

**BOARD ACTIONS**

**M/S (Liebich / Gilbert) I move to approve the recommended procedures for the management of emergency provisional certificates as presented in Attachment 1.**

A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 7-0. Dr. David Hill was absent from voting.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

7. Recommendations from the Empowering Parents Advisory Panel

Superintendent Critchfield started the discussion by providing a little overview of this program. She reminded everyone that the first iteration was called Strong Families, Strong Students with funding made available through Federal coronavirus relief funds. During the 2022 legislative session the Legislature created the Empowering Parents program, and in 2023 \$30 million dollars of ongoing money was appropriated for the program. The Empowering Parents statute requires the formation of a 7-member parent advisory panel whose direct responsibility and role is to create recommendations that would be presented to the Board of Education, and then also to hear any appeals.

The statute further requires that the 7-member parent panel be assigned in the following manner; 3 members appointed by the Governor, 2 members appointed by the Speaker of the House and 2 members appointed by the President Pro Tempore of the Senate, so no member of the Board of Education, nor staff from OSBE or SDE made appointments to the parent panel.

The parent panel met a total of 6 times starting in June 2023 culminating in their recommendations being brought forward to the Board at the October Board of Education meeting, all of which can be found in the Board Actions as presented.

**BOARD ACTION**

**BOARDWORK  
DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

**M/S (Liebich / Gilbert) I move to adopt the recommended addition of eligible products and services and additional business procedures as set forth in Attachment 2, and to express support of the recommendations that require statutory changes provided to the Board by the Empowering Parents Parent Advisory Panel as presented in the cover sheet, excluding recommendations 4.2.a and 4.2.b. A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 7-0. Dr. David Hill was absent from voting.**

**AND**

**M/S (Liebich / Gilbert) I move to express support of recommendation 4.1.c on the condition that the legislature support the use of Empowering Parent Grant Program funds for homeschool co-op fees. A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 7-0. Dr. David Hill was absent from voting.**

**AND**

**M/S (Liebich / Gilbert) I move to express support of recommendation 4.2.a. and 4.2.b, regarding the allowance of reimbursements as part of the Empowering Parents Grant Program on the condition that the funds and positions necessary to administer a reimbursement program are appropriated. A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 7-0. Dr. David Hill was absent from voting.**

Mr. Freeman asked to share some historical context with the Board. He said that with Strong Families, Strong Students, reimbursement was allowed, however there were 5 temporary full-time employees in the State Controller's office who reviewed all of those reimbursement requests to make sure that they met the criteria. This process still presented a significant burden on OSBE staff. Ultimately, OSBE had to make the final call on what was allowed, so the caveat in the third motion just presented, around the funds and positions appropriated to administer the program, is critical.

Ms. Thompson said that currently there is one full-time program manager overseeing the day-to-day running of the program and each transaction has to be reviewed. With \$70 million dollars running through this program and with each parent being able to make roughly 10 purchases that means that staff are reviewing 70,000 purchases which equates to 2 full-time positions which we do not have.

Mrs. Roach asked Mr. Freeman what the process would be to request additional FTE to accommodate having people to review every reimbursement request. Mr. Freeman said the appropriate process would be for new positions and the associated funding to be included in legislation adopting the recommended changes.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

**BOARDWORK  
DECEMBER 13, 2023**

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

---

8. PPGA Committee Priorities Update

Ms. Thompson shared that the PPGA committee reviewed the most recent version of its priorities and initiatives on August 4, 2023. The Committee asked for more focus on “timely data”. The PPGA committee narrowed down the scope to 4 priorities; Educational System Alignment; Educator Effectiveness; Educational Readiness; K-20 Guided Pathways. For a complete rundown of the priorities see PPGA, Tab 8, Attachment 1.

Dr. Clark asked about Middle School Math, which is a Board priority but is not on the document. Ms. Thompson said that the Math Workgroup will be meeting in December and information will be coming to the Board at the next Board meeting.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

9. Educator Preparation Program New Program Approval Process

Ms. Thompson reviewed for the Board the following information. The Board Office constructed a work group in January 2023 to create a new Educator Preparation Provider review process at the direction of the State Board. The work group had a representative from each Idaho approved Educator Preparation Program, State Department of Education Staff, and Career Technical Staff. The work group created the Idaho Standards for Educator Preparation Providers that would be used to evaluate the Educator Preparation Programs against for the state provider review. The Idaho Standards for Educator Preparation Providers were shared with stakeholders to obtain input. Two work sessions were held with the Professional Standards Commission (Joint Standards and Authorization’s Committees) to review the standards and obtain input. The input from the first work session was shared with the work group and the input was accepted. The changes were made to the Idaho Standards for Educator Preparation Providers. The second work session was held, and the Professional Standards Commission voted to recommend the Idaho Standards for Educator Preparation Providers.

The work group created a new program approval process that would be used by educator preparation providers to add a new program. One work session was held with the Professional Standards Commission (Joint Standards and Authorization’s Committees) to review the new program approval process. The input from the work session was shared with the work group and the input was accepted. The changes were made to the new program approval process.

The work group met January 17, 2023, January 23, 2023, January 31, 2023, February 10, 2023, and March 24, 2023. The new program approval process will include three

**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

steps: 1. Preparation and Submission of the New Program Application, 2. Review and Feedback, and 3. Determination of Approval Status. The Professional Standards Commission met to review the final documents on September 21, 2023. A few non-material edits were made based on that discussion.

If the Board approves the new program approval process, as outlined in Attachment 1, the new program approval process will be used by educator preparation providers to request new programs.

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Liebich / Siddoway) I move to approve the new program approval process for Educator Preparation Providers as submitted in Attachment 1.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 7-0. Dr. David Hill was absent from voting.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

10. CTE Educator Training Update

Dr. Clay Long, Administrator, Career Technical Education, gave the update to the Board.

He shared that in Idaho there are 3 paths for people to become a CTE educator.

1. College / University Educator Prep Programs - offered at multiple institutions for business and marketing programs agriculture programs, engineering technology, Education and Family Consumer Sciences.
2. Occupational Specialist - Individuals come from industry with a combination of years of experience, industry, certification, or education and CTE puts them through the Inspire Ready Program where they will earn a three-year limited occupational certificate. They then have 3 years to work through their training. If they successfully complete the program they are issued their five-year renewable certificate.
3. Alternative Authorization - the last route are unique situations where an individual wants to become a CD educator but doesn't necessarily fit nicely in occupational specialists for the teacher prep program. So CTE works with them to build an individualized plan to get them prepared.

CTE recruits from the following sources;

1. Retirees who want to give back
2. Early-in career workers disillusioned with work environment
3. Trade workers seeking to teach as they age

All recruits then go through InSpire Ready and the 5 different modules and there is a mentor assigned to each student. All modules are currently being delivered through College of Southern Idaho through their Teacher Prep Program.

**BOARDWORK  
DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

The two programs there are no education prep programs are trades in industry or health professions.

As of June 2023, there were 310 new teachers in the pipeline, with an additional 115 new teachers being accepted into the program most recently.

Dr. Clark asked if CTE was meeting the needs of the students who want CTE training? Dr. Long said yes, the issue comes when CTE instructors retire and if the district has no one else to take their place they simply shut the program down. That is where seeking out individuals who can participate in the Alternative Authorization training program can come in handy to keep programs running.

Dr. Clark asked why CTE did not have training options for health-related fields. Dr. Long said most often there are requirements for industry experience specific in the health program. For example, a CNA instructor that requires an RN plus many years of experience in a long care facility, if we required them to go back and get a bachelor's degree he wasn't sure how many students would participate. The second consideration is the career ladder which does not consider years of experience over years of teaching, so the pay differential between what industry can pay versus what teaching can pay is sometimes a stumbling block.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

#### 11. Idaho Vocational Rehabilitation (VR) Annual Report

Jane Donnellan, Administrator, Vocational Rehabilitation, gave the annual report to the Board. She shared the following starting with the Mission and Vision of VR.

**Mission** - To prepare individuals with disabilities for employment and career opportunities while meeting the needs of employers.

**Vision** - An Idaho where all individuals with disabilities have the opportunity to participate in the workforce and employers value their contributions.

VR has two distinct programs; the largest being Vocational Rehabilitation (with a budget of \$25 million dollars) and the second being the Council for the Deaf and Hard of Hearing (\$570,000 budget out of the general fund).

- VR is one of the oldest State and federal programs in the nation.
- VR is not a welfare program but a means to self-sufficiency.
- Services available may include evaluation of rehabilitation, potential vocational guidance and counseling; physical and mental restoration; vocational, academic and other related training opportunities.



**BOARDWORK  
DECEMBER 13, 2023**

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

- In FY 2023 VR served 4323 participants.
- Six hundred ninety participants are employed an average of 29 hours a week with an average wage of \$17.17 an hour.
- Seventy-five percent of VR customers who successfully entered in employment had their wages as their primary source of income. Reflecting a decrease of reliance on public assistance, or family.
- During FY23 VR supported 635 unique individuals in various post, secondary education and training.
- Seventeen school districts are participating in paid work experience for students during the school year. The districts provide the teachers and para educators while VR pays the students wages.
- During the summer VR was able to collaborate with 22 school districts with over 300 students participating in paid work experience programs, many of them in rural communities.
- Just this past year a collaboration program began with Winco called Winco Wins which taught students how to work in a distribution center. Of the four students who participated two were offered employment when the month-long training concluded.

Mr. Gilbert asked if for the counselors who don't meet the job qualifications is there a work around or is that a federal requirement? Ms. Donnellan said VR has a strong belief that somebody with a master's in rehab counseling really has those professional skills that are required. VR does have an underfill position that they utilize where they expect the new hire to reach their educational level within 5 years of hire. Ideally it would be desirable to recruit them out of their master's programs already ready to do the work that VR needs them to do.

Mr. Liebich asked Ms. Donnellan to comment on if VR was able to provide the services to Idahoans that need the support? Or are there times where we don't have the resources because of a lack of counseling staff. And then for those Idahoans that are getting support, are we able to provide those employment opportunities for them, or is there a shortage of employment? Ms. Donnellan said there are still challenges in the general community and understanding the potential of hiring people with disabilities and what they can offer employers. That is why VR is building up their business services in order to meet that need. VR is actively partnering with school districts to develop those career technical programs for VR students but with staffing challenges all that work is difficult.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

## 12. Consideration of Graduation Equivalency



**BOARDWORK  
DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

Ms. Thompson said Idaho Code § 74-1205 establishes the Idaho Launch Grant Program to be administered by the Workforce Development Council. The grant provides a reimbursement of the lesser of \$8,000 or 80% of the cost of tuition and fees at an eligible institution. This legislation went into effect on July 1, 2023, and initial grant awards will be made in December 2023.

Idaho Code § 72-1204(1)(f)(ii) defines a Launch Grant Program eligible student, in part, as an Idaho resident “who will graduate from an accredited high school or its equivalent in Idaho as determined by the board beginning with the spring 2024 graduating class”.

In order to assist the Workforce Development Council with its administration of the grant, it has been requested that the Board define graduation equivalency.

Board staff consulted the Division of Career Technical Education to review GED completer data and worked with the OSBE research team to review the Census American Community Survey data regarding Idahoans who do not hold a high school diploma.

In closing, if the Board approves the recommended definition of equivalent to an accredited high school, the defined term will assist the Workforce Development Council in administering the Launch Grant Program.

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Liebich / Roach) I move, that for the purposes of administering the Launch Grant Program, the equivalent of graduation from an accredited high school be defined as: individuals who earn a general equivalency diploma (GED) by not later than the age of twenty-one (21) or home school students who can produce a transcript reflecting successful completion of the Board approved graduation requirements in effect as of the date of the transcript, attested to by a parent or legal guardian.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 7-0. Dr. David Hill was absent from voting.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

At this time the Board took a break returning at 2:45 p.m. (PT).

**STATE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION**

1. Superintendent’s Update - Information Item

Superintendent Critchfield shared three updates with the Board.

- **Idaho Career Ready Students (ICRS) update** - This past July the Idaho Legislature appropriated the first \$45 million dollars to the career technical

**BOARDWORK  
DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

programs. SDE is prioritizing programs that are unique to regions that look at very specific rural needs. The ICRS council is composed of 11 members of which the Superintendent is the voting chair of the Committee. As of today, there have been 13 grants awarded reflecting \$16.8 million dollars. However there have been \$48 million dollars in requests received which is not a surprise since running Career Technical Programs is more expensive than traditional programs. Requests receiving prioritization are those with an industry or business partner to help meet the needs of the students. As of right now awards have been granted to region 2 (3); region 3 (3); region 4 (5); region 5 (2); region 6 (2). No awards have been made yet in region 1 but the council will meet again in November to look at further requests.

Mr. Liebich asked program specific questions. First, all of these programs have initial startup costs, how will the districts address the ongoing costs they will incur year over year? Or, are you providing multi-year ongoing grants? Superintendent Critchfield said it's a mix of all of that. As this is a one-time money award the district needs to come in and say, we believe that with this startup money we'll be able to handle the teacher salary and the curriculum but we'll find the resources to move the program forward after the initial startup.

Mr. Gilbert asked if there was a deadline to spend the funds and for the smaller school districts who might not have the personnel to apply for grant funds how did the council take their needs into consideration? Superintendent Critchfield replied that there was no deadline to spend the funds and the council did look at the application process for smaller school districts and are working with them to ensure they have a way to participate in the grant process.

- **Modernizing School Funding / K-12 Budget Submission** - SDE has identified 4 goals to modernize school funding.
  - ✓ SDE will be asking for a 4.2% increase in public school budgets which represents \$120 million dollars of new money.
  - ✓ \$45 million dollars will be moved into the discretionary fund category which will allow the districts more flexibility in spending their own money.
  - ✓ The enrollment to attendance changes left money on the table that was appropriated. This added a \$92 million-dollar supplemental request for the current school year. This request stems from the fact that based on the rule change districts were not able to access the funding for attendance. The accompanying change to this request will require statutory changes to define seat time; how does the district define an attending student?
  - ✓ A \$3 million-dollar request for a pilot program to pay student teachers. This would be a recurring program to pay them each year for three years.

**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

- **Graduation Requirements Timeline** - The requirements have not been reviewed in a substantive way since 2010.
  - ✓ One of the newest components to be added is the financial literacy component.
  - ✓ Working through the PPGA committee SDE will convene a working group from the House and Senate, both Education Committees, the Governor's office, school administrators, school boards, counselors, 2 and four-year institutions, district curriculum directors and the teacher's association to review graduation requirements. The hope is to bring recommendations to the Board at the April 2024 Board meeting. Some of the questions this group will be addressing are; What do we want an Idaho diploma to stand for? What are those things that we want to prioritize and say, every kid, regardless of where you are in the State, whatever your educational environment is, here are the things that we believe will benefit every single kid when they exit our system? Do we require math in the senior year or do we use math pathways as a means of assessing what math pathway is best for the student?

At this time Ryan Cantrell, Chief Deputy Superintendent, State Department of Education took the microphone and updated the Board on K-3 Idaho Reading Indicator (IRI) Spring Scores. He shared the following;

- Istation is the current vendor for IRI - they service 493,000 students in 42 states.
- Idaho is one of only a few states that require an early literacy assessment.
- There is \$35 million dollars of early literacy money that goes to school districts based on the IRI data so these results are critical to the districts.
- Testing results from 2021 to 2023 show that kindergarten students have improved their IRI scores; first-grade students showed a slight decline in scores; second and third grades students are doing exceptionally well at 75% proficient showing that students coming out of the pandemic have regained a lot of the early learning loss shown during past testing.
- Comparing Idaho students to the other students Istation tests shows that Idaho students are doing really well.
- The impact all-day kindergarten will have on IRI scores will not be known until the next testing cycle.

Dr. Clark asked how many of these students would be considered dyslexic students. Mr. Cantrell said teachers are becoming better at identifying characteristics of dyslexia, but students with dyslexia can still be proficient on the IRI.

Mr. Liebich asked if the districts have the tools to do the incremental formative assessments to inform instruction? Mr. Cantrell said yes, and the interim assessments have improved over the last 5 years. Knowing those scores helps teachers to make adjustments to their teaching to address areas that students show weaknesses in.

**BOARDWORK  
DECEMBER 13, 2023**

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

**WORK SESSION**

**PLANNING, POLICY AND GOVERNMENTAL AFFAIRS**

**A. Idaho Commission on Hispanic Affairs**

Margie Gonzalez, Executive Director, Idaho Commission on Hispanic Affairs, led the work session. She shared the following with the Board.

- Statewide there are 239,407 Hispanics in Idaho which makes them the largest minority group, representing over 13% of the total state population.
- Poverty rates are higher among the state's Hispanic children under age 18, with 29% living in poverty.
- A large share of the Hispanic population in Idaho is made up of children and young adults, with few other individuals. There are currently 22,068 Hispanic youth under the age of 5 in Idaho.
- Eighteen percent of the student population in K-12 are students of Hispanic culture. The largest concentration of students can be found in the Boise metro area; Nampa; West Ada; Vallivue and Caldwell.
- Largest challenge is recruiting and retaining teachers of color. During the 2021-22 school year, Idaho public schools employed 2,054 Hispanics who made up just 5% of all employees. This number is made up of school teachers; principals, counselors, nurses, social workers, assistant superintendents and 1 Superintendent and 1 physical therapist.
- In 2021-22, 9,843 Hispanic students made up 16% of Idaho's total postsecondary enrollment. This was an increase from 2018, when Hispanic students made up 10% of total enrollment.
- Idaho's go-on rate in fall 2018 was 45%. Among Hispanics in Idaho, the rate was 39%. In Idaho and the nation, go-on rates among female high school graduates are higher than among males. Almost half of Idaho's Hispanic female high school graduates, but only 36% of Hispanic male graduates, enrolled in postsecondary education in fall 2018.
- In 2021-22 there were 6,309 migrant students in Idaho. The total number of English Language Learners in Idaho is 19,542. The ELL Migrant number is currently 2,634 students.

The Commission made several recommendations to the Board which could reduce the educational achievement gap for the Hispanic student population.

- Establish a dedicated staff position at the State Department of Education to coordinate and support efforts to increase academic achievement and educational opportunities for the K-12 Hispanic student population.

**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

- Establish a dedicated staff position at the Office of the State Board of Education to coordinate and support efforts in the transition from high school to college or career for the postsecondary Hispanic student population.
- Provide easily accessible data to the Commission about Idaho Hispanic students across the K-20 spectrum.
- Provide representation at the annual Idaho Hispanic Youth Leadership Summit, the largest gathering of Idaho Hispanic youth in the state.
- Take steps to enhance the Educator Preparation Program to improve recruitment and retainment of Hispanic educators.
- Establish a Hispanic Education Committee of the Board, similar in scope and structure to the Idaho Indian Education Committee.

Dr. Clark mentioned that she personally attended three of the four Hispanic Youth Summits recently and they were well attended. Thousands of Hispanic students were engaged and interested in what the Idaho institutions had to share with them. They learned about Idaho Launch, scholarship opportunities and Apply Idaho.

Mr. Gilbert asked if there was any data on how many Hispanic students in either kindergarten or first grade were bilingual? Ms. Gonzalez said most students come to school speaking Spanish since that is the primary language in their homes. As to how many finish grades as bilingual, or with English proficiency, she would have to gather that data and get the information to the Board.

Mr. Liebich asked Matt Freeman if the Board office had ever historically looked into having a Hispanic Education Committee or in sharing the data that Ms. Gonzalez is requesting. Mr. Freeman was not aware of any historical request for such a position. As far as the data issue, the Board of Education office does have several agreements with agencies to share data so that request should be straightforward.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

**Thursday, October 19, 2023 - 09:00 a.m. (Pacific Time)**

**OPEN FORUM**

The following Idaho citizens addressed the Board during Open Forum.

Amanda Fletcher - Empowering Parents Grant

*"Hello, my name is Amanda Fletcher, and would like to comment about the Empowering Parents Grant and the Parent Advisory Panel recommendations. They have recommended a process be established for reimbursements. I would like to address why I feel that is necessary. My youngest son has a reading disability, he needs a*

**BOARDWORK  
DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

*specialized curriculum(s) that's not available through the Marketplace. I was unable to utilize the grant funds and I had to pay out of pocket. I purchased through a national distributor that sells to schools, as these big companies are not vendors it would be ideal to have the ability to be reimbursed. I have also purchased a yearly audiobook subscription for him through the nonprofit Learning Ally, this service is only available for those with documented disabilities. Yet again grant funds were not available for this purchase as they are not a vendor. There are many more useful ways I'd like to spend this grant but am held back by the lack of diversity in the Marketplace as well as not having an alternate way to approve purchases for our most vulnerable students, those with disabilities. I can only urge the Board while moving forward to keep children with disabilities in mind and how this grant can better serve them. Thank you."*

Shelby Murdock - Empowering Parents Grant

*"I'm Shelby Murdock, founder and owner of Snake River Strings Co. Thank you for this opportunity, even on short notice. I only became aware yesterday of the meetings regarding the Empowering Parents Grant, and while I apologize for any overlap with previous decisions, I believe my perspective is vital to my community.*

*As a proud native of Southeast Idaho and an Idaho State University alumnus, I have a deep connection to this state. With a degree in Music Education and a background as a national champion old-time fiddler, I understand the value of arts in education. I was also an Idaho Governor's Cup scholarship recipient and have been a music teacher for 17 years, both privately and in public schools. In 2019, I founded Snake River Strings Co., a private music school and the first music business of its kind in Idaho.*

*In the fall of 2022 we swiftly became an approved vendor for the Idaho Empowering Parents Grant, serving over 227 students to date. As one of the few approved music school vendors on Odyssey, we adhere to rigorous standards, including tax documentation, background checks, and drug-free workplace policies. Many other private music teachers throughout the state operate without these standards and regulations, teaching music as an under-the-table side hustle in their living room. I, along with other vendors in my area, am frustrated by the lack of communication and the absence of our perspective in the decision-making process. We needed to be actively notified of a platform to share our experiences as hands-on vendors, but were not.*

*As a vendor, I would like to express feedback on three crucial points that were on the agenda yesterday:*

*First, I encourage the approval of classes on the Odyssey marketplace, taught by qualified Idahoans who pay taxes and follow proper documentation. The grant's purpose*



**BOARDWORK  
DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

*is to help students recover from the pandemic, and classes in music, dance, and art are the way to go, not just more technology.*

*Second, the vendor approval process does not need to be streamlined. Companies should be actively willing to demonstrate their qualifications to ensure they are worthy of state funds.*

*Third, prioritize Idaho businesses. Our Idaho Taxpayer dollars need to support local businesses, NOT out-of-state companies.*

*I am grateful for this grant, which has greatly benefited my community. It holds immense promise for arts education in Idaho. To ensure its success, I would ask that you please consider adding a vendor representative on the panel and keep us informed of public forums. We are passionate Idahoans and small business owners who can contribute to the program's development, as well as the development of the children within our state.*

*Thank you for your time and consideration."*

**INSTRUCTION, RESEARCH AND STUDENT AFFAIRS**

1. Board Policy III.N. – Statewide General Education – Second Reading – Action Item

Dr. TJ Bliss, Chief Academic Affairs Officer, Idaho State Board of Education, led the discussion. He said the major changes to this policy, which relate to general education, allow for institutions to bring forward proposals for programs that do not require the full 36 credits of general education to better serve students who may be transferring into programs where those general education requirements are spread out over the four years of the bachelor's degree. In particular, when referencing engineering degrees, to make sure that students transferring from our community colleges are on equal footing when they matriculate into the four-year institution, we added, prior to that first reading through a conversation with the IRSA committee, specific information in the policy that requires institutions to justify these changes and ensure that we're holding the line on general education. There were no comments between the first and second reading.

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Roach / Siddoway) I move to approve the second reading of proposed amendments to Board Policy III.N., Statewide General Education, as submitted in Attachment 1.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 7-0. Dr. David Hill was absent from voting.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

2. Board Policy III.W. – Higher Education Research – Second Reading



**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

Dr. Bliss mentioned this was also a second reading. He said this higher education research policy outlines and stipulates how the Higher Education Research Council (HERC) functions as well as the EPSCoR committee and the Center for Advanced Energy Studies (CAES) and there are major changes to this policy to bring them into conformity with the current practice of HERC in terms of its structure as well as aligning the policy with current formatting. Removing philosophy statements which have been in the policy for a while and moving those into the bylaws of HERC is prudent. One change will allow for HERC to consider distributing some undergraduate research funds to the community colleges and those conversations are ongoing. An update on that will be provided to the IRSA committee at the next meeting but that change is significant and important. There were no comments or feedback on the proposed amendments between the first and second reading.

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Roach / Critchfield) I move to approve the second reading of Board Policy III.W., Higher Education Research as submitted in Attachment 1, and to direct staff to work with INL to develop any necessary updates to the CAES MOU and bring proposed updates to the Board for its consideration.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 7-0. Dr. David Hill was absent from voting.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

3. Board Policy III.Z. – Planning and Delivery of Postsecondary Programs and Courses – Second Reading

Dr. Bliss said this policy amendment is significant but not very long just a few words to exempt prison education from the requirements of the policy and there were no comments between first and second reading.

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Roach / Critchfield) I move to approve the second reading of proposed amendments to Board Policy III. Z., Planning and Delivery of Postsecondary Education Programs and Courses as submitted in Attachment 1.** A roll call vote was taken and the motion passed 7-0. Dr. David Hill was absent from voting.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

4. Military General Education Crosswalk Update

Dr. Heidi Estrem, Associate Academic Officer, Idaho State Board of Education, started the discussion by stating the opportunity for students to earn postsecondary credit(s) by demonstrating requisite knowledge, usually through performance on comprehensive exams or portfolio-based evidence of learning, is generally referred to as a prior

**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

learning assessment (PLA). PLAs bridge the gap between learning acquired in and outside of postsecondary learning environments while also minimizing the time and cost necessary for earning college-level credentials. Board Policy III.L. provides the minimum requirements for PLAs.

The most popular PLAs include: Advanced Placement (AP), College Level Examination Program (CLEP), academic department challenge exams, and student portfolio evaluation. For active duty military personnel and veterans, the Joint Services Transcript (JST) and DANTES Subject Standardized Tests (DSST) are traditional forms of PLA. Learners who earn credit through PLAs are more likely to persist and graduate in more economical terms.

General Education faculty have reviewed hundreds of military occupations for potential prior learning credits and have made an initial set of recommendations that advisors and transcript evaluators will be able to use at all eight institutions. Board staff will continue to gather potential PLA equivalencies, draw on general education faculty to make recommendations, and disseminate these equivalencies to the institutions for the next two years, then reevaluate this effort.

Currently, campuses are actively building wholistic approaches that better support active military members, veterans, and their families. The general education crosswalk work will continue in close collaboration with these other efforts.

For military veterans, the General Education Military Equivalencies Guide provides clear guidelines for military occupational PLA at all eight institutions by recognizing the advanced skills that these learners bring to our institutions.

Scott Greco, Deputy Director, Idaho State Board of Education, continued the discussion. He introduced Krysta Madrigal, College of Eastern Idaho VA School Financial Aid Advisor; Todd Johnson, Director, Idaho State University's Veterans Service Center; John Hawbaker, Director, Boise State University Veterans Service Center; Jason Nierman, Director, University of Idaho Military and Veterans Service Center.

They shared the following;

- 2736 students in FY 2022 used the GI bill to attend courses in Idaho institutions.
- 1935 post 9/11 GI bill awards were made representing \$20 million in tuition and fees paid to Idaho institutions and \$44 million was paid for military housing allowance and a book stipend.
- 46 Yellow Ribbon Scholarship Awards were granted amounting to over \$380,000.

Dr. Clark asked the panel to discuss the limitations that have been found in helping the military veterans move forward with their educations. It was shared that if too many

**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

military service credits are transferred it can affect their elective credits, damage their GPA and can also limit or reduce their housing allowance. Some of the colleges have created a challenge process for college courses such as in the LPN program where veterans can challenge a course and receive the credits without having to take the course again.

Mr. Liebich asked if there was anything the Board could do to reduce the complexities veteran students are facing as they try to get their college degree. It was suggested that if the schools had the ability to transfer in the credits that best suited the students needs and to leave off the others, that would be helpful. Another pitfall is found in the financial aid sector. If students have accrued 1.5 times the number of credits that they need to earn a degree, but they have yet to earn a degree, then by the current metrics they're not making satisfactory academic progress and then they have to petition to apply for Federal financial aid. Bottom line is if it takes 120 credits to earn an engineering degree, and the person has accrued 180 credits with all that they've transferred in, then they become ineligible for Federal financial aid unless they petition and explain the situation, which the college veterans' services offices help them with. Again, if we could be selective in the number of credits that we transfer in, I think that would help the student.

Dr. Estrem made two quick points. Our bachelor's degree programs that are designed to best serve our military students in areas that bring in particular kinds of credit need to be better aligned from the beginning to create a complete degree plan. Our 4-year institutions have a maximum number of credits that can be brought in, usually around 25. We have found that if we do give too much transferable credit the student may have issues in their foundational knowledge to progress through the program. We know military veterans say they want to get their degrees quicker, but we need to guarantee the quality of education that they receive.

Dr. Bliss restated that the Board of Education office will be working with the Deputy Attorney General to write a new rule on the issues surrounding residency for military veterans. He is hoping to bring this action item to the December Board meeting.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

Board member Keough left the meeting at 9:54 a.m. (PT).

#### 5. Annual Remediation Report

Dr. Heidi Estrem gave the annual report. She started by sharing that Board Policy III.S. Remedial Education requires institutions to report annually to the Board their "success rates in corequisite support models" and success rates in other "remedial courses" annually. This report is a summary of institutional data submitted to the Office of the

**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

State Board of Education, covering remediation success rates through the end of the 2021-2022 academic year.

The Board authorizes three remediation models for use in the public postsecondary institutions for English and Mathematics:

- Corequisite Course or Support Model – Remedial instruction is offered in a designated course taught in the same term and in tandem with the course material for the college level offering, most typically by the same instructor and with a complimentary meeting pattern.
- Embedded Model – Remedial content is delivered during the same classroom setting as the college level course offering. Since this model also enrolls students in the credit-bearing course, it is counted as Corequisite support for the purposes of this report.
- Emporium Model – Remedial content is typically delivered through a self-paced computer lab setting where modules or learning packets are available to the individual student.

In addition to these authorized remediation models, pursuant to Board Policy III.S, “institutions may pilot the use of Alternative delivery models, provided the models are evidence based. Institutions choosing to exercise this pilot option shall notify both the Council on Academic Affairs and Programs and the Instruction, Research, and Student Affairs Committee of their intent to pilot a new delivery model and the results of said pilot. Piloted models must be assessed annually and may be continued and scaled beyond the first year if the pilot achieves equal or greater success rates in students completing gateway mathematics and English courses as compared to rates achieved in approved Corequisite Support models.”

While English remediation in the eight public postsecondary institutions in Idaho is now exclusively offered through the Corequisite course model, math remediation is offered through several pedagogical models across the eight institutions, including the Corequisite models, the Emporium model, and Alternative models in pilot. Some institutions still offer Traditional math remediation as they transition to an authorized model as required by Board policy. No institution is implementing an alternative approach to math remediation in a formal pilot, but some institutions offer Math 108, which is considered an alternate form of traditional remediation, except in cases where Math 108 is the required math course for Career Technical Education programs.

The Corequisite approach is used for first-year writing courses (English) at all eight Idaho public postsecondary institutions. The number of students enrolling in writing Corequisite support courses has declined by 36% over time, and pass rates for students in the Corequisite model are higher (68.2%) than historical pass rates using the now-defunct Traditional model (62.9%).

**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

The support and remediation models are more complex in math as many institutions offer two or more models at the same time, and different support or remediation models may be aligned with different general education math courses. However, the number of students completing all forms of remedial math has declined by 55.6% over time. Across all institutions, pass rates are highest in Corequisite (70.6%) and Hybrid models (78.2%); Hybrid is a variation that provides accelerated, flexible mathematics instruction. At institutions that offer multiple models, the number of students enrolled in each model varies, which could cause variations in pass rates.

The longitudinal data continue to indicate that Corequisite remediation is the most successful model for both math and writing in terms of student pass rates in those courses. This result is bolstered by additional data in the report showing that students who successfully complete a Corequisite course are more likely to pass a subsequent credit-bearing math or English course than students who completed a remedial course using any other model.

Statewide research indicates that pandemic-related learning losses have had an outsized impact on mathematics learning across all grade levels. Institutions are continuing to explore how to best support accepted college students whose mathematics skills seem to indicate that they need substantial support. Mathematics instruction is receiving additional support and attention through a few efforts, including a two-year Board effort to enhance high-impact teaching practices in general education mathematics while also supporting the continued transition to corequisite mathematics courses. Eight years ago, over 10,000 students were in some form of remedial math, and now it's fewer than 5,000.

Mr. Gilbert expressed concern over the large drop in the number of students who did not need remediation help and wondered why this was. Dr. Estrem said some of that is because we have expanded the number of math pathways. So, for example, there are different math opportunities for students going into humanities or social sciences, or courses that don't actually need a precalculus pathway. So, students are able to take the math pathway that best suits their degree program, but all students must meet the entry level math requirement. For example, the percent of degrees in our institutions that require a calculus course is 19%. That means 80% of all degree programs in higher education don't require calculus yet every K-12 student is on a calculus path.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

6. Engineering & Computer Science Needs Assessment & Gap Analysis

Mr. Greco introduced Patrick Lane and Christina Sedney from the Western Interstate Commission for Higher Education (WICHE) who mentioned that in 2022, Governor Little recommended, and the legislature appropriated, \$100,000 in one-time General Funds

**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

for the Office of the State Board of Education to develop a statewide needs assessment for engineering and computer science education in Idaho.

In November 2022, the Office of the State Board of Education entered into a Professional Services Agreement with the Western Interstate Commission for Higher Education (WICHE) to complete the engineering and computer science needs assessment. The scope of the WICHE needs assessment addressed two important questions:

- Is the supply of engineering and computer science graduates from Idaho's public institutions adequate to meet current and projected industry demand?
- If not, how can the State strategically address the gap between supply and demand?

WICHE's top level findings from its assessment are twofold:

- Current Undersupply: The supply of graduates in engineering and computing disciplines (broadly defined) from the states' public institutions does not appear sufficient to meet existing industry needs.

In order to increase supply the following recommendations were given;

- Improving high school math preparedness;
- Increasing the number of students (especially female students) who chose engineering/engineering technology or computer and information science as a major
- Supporting students through graduation
- Expanding outreach to non-traditional-aged students

In 2023 there were 1953 openings for engineering and computer science graduates. There is expected to be annual job openings in these fields at the rate of 1,364 jobs. Public and private degrees earned were 1,289 which is a shortage of 870-degree seekers.

- Future Supply Constraints: Growing the number of students prepared to enter and succeed in these majors is not as simple as increasing postsecondary capacity. Demographic and educational trends point to, at best, modest growth in the potential pool of students, meaning any effort to increase graduates in these fields must focus on expanding the educational pipeline of students from K-12 to postsecondary education who are interested in and equipped to succeed in these fields.

If current trends continue, fewer than 5 additional engineering bachelor's degrees per year. If current trends continue, fewer than 2 additional computer & information science bachelor's degrees per year.

Gender gaps are alarming when you control for math performance in high school.



**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

Among students with the highest math scores about one quarter of those students who are males enter into engineering, but only 7% of females with equivalent math scores enter into the same major. For computer science 15% of top scoring males enter the program compared to only 3% of females. Also concerning is that of those who do graduate with a degree in engineering only 60% of the students are still employed in Idaho after graduation.

**Potential Next Steps**

- Creating a Shared Vision & Coordinated Plan
- Identifying Clear Roles & Responsibilities (Identify individual & collaborative strategic approach for each partner)
- Data & Metrics (Identify meaningful, trackable key metrics and monitor over time)
- Investing for Impact (Determine if a broad or a targeted approach will be most effective)

Dr. Clark asked Dr. Bliss to follow up on this report and come up with some recommendations that the Board could get behind to help change the narrative. Mr. Greco assured Dr. Clark that this report had been presented to the Governor's office, to our Education policy advisor, and all three-industry advisory board leads at Idaho's institutions. In addition, it has been sent to the STEM Action Center, the Micron Foundation, Idaho National Lab, the Idaho Technology Council and then distributed to the industry advisory boards and to the participants who assisted in providing data to the report. Both Mr. Lane and Ms. Sedney have offered to present this report to both the House and Senate Education Committees when session begins.

Superintendent Critchfield asked that the IRSA committee bring back to the Board a recommendation for a working group to address the issues found in this report with specific entities who need to be involved and to do it quickly. This work group should have a working plan in place before anyone presents to the Legislature.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

At this time the Board took a 10-minute break returning at 10:52 a.m. (PT).

**7. Established Program to Stimulate Competitive Research (EPSCoR) Annual Report**

Dr. Andy Kliskey, Project Director, EPSCoR gave the annual report to the Board.

He shared the following;

- For FY 22 Idaho and all of its institutions brought in a total of \$42.2 million dollars in funding. That is a 71% increase from FY18.
- Since FY18, 23% of Idaho's' NSF funding is EPSCoR RII+.
- Idaho's share of total NSF Funding is .31% (FY 18-22).



**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

- From October 2018 - Dec 2023 there were 6 new faculty hired; 20 post docs; 67 grad students; 94 undergrads and 30 grad students in the Gem3 Genes to Environment: Modeling, Mechanisms, and Mapping Track 1 RII.
- Gem3 Project Outputs - there were 106 publications made; 188 NSF proposals submitted equaling \$282.5 million and 84 NSF grants awarded totaling \$33.4 million dollars.

**Idaho EPSCoR Track-1 impact**

- Summary analysis of Idaho EPSCoR 2013 – 2023 (for Idaho Legislative Services Office)
- 677 students supported in research and education at Idaho universities and colleges (BSU, ISU, UI, CSI, CWI, LCSC) through NSF EPSCoR RII Track-1 since 2013.
  - 452 undergraduate students who pursued STEM degrees
  - 225 graduate students who pursued masters and doctoral degrees
- undergraduates in EPSCoR programs gained measurable and significant improvements in knowledge, skills, and competences required for long-term success in science, technology, engineering, and mathematics disciplines and careers
- EPSCoR-supported students have a higher graduation rate than the average rate at our Idaho universities in general

Two new programs will be replacing RII Track 1 -

**E-Core** {Builds capacity in 1 or more targeted research infrastructure cores}

**E-Rise** {Supports incubation of research in a scientific field leading to increased research capacity and competitiveness in the topical area and sustainable improvements}.

**Implications for Idaho**

- Eligibility has been broadened (universities, colleges, Tribal nations, non-profits) and is single institution
- Retains strong State-wide focus
- Can submit (and hold) more than 1 E-CORE and E-RISE in the State
- Role of the Statewide Steering Committee (EPSCoR Committee) is more focused
- Role of the State Science & Technology Plan (Higher Education Research Strategy) is more active and critical
- For maximum benefit the State should consider approaching these programs strategically

Mr. Liebich asked if specific industry input was happening prior to the grant requests being made. For example, was Micron involved in prioritizing the types of grant that are being pursued from a higher ed perspective. Dr. Kliskey said Micron does not have a seat on the EPSCoR committee so perhaps adding new memberships to the committee

**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

would be appropriate. Mr. Liebich concluded that he feels its very important then for the focus of the EPSCoR Committee to look at their composition and bring in representation who can help pivot to the needs of industry in the state.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

**WORK SESSION**

**PLANNING, POLICY AND GOVERNMENTAL AFFAIRS**

**B. Performance Measures Reporting**

Ms. Thompson began the work session by saying that she asked the Research team to present this information in a different format. Instead of talking about the data they were asked to come to conclusions such as what does the data mean, what are the actionable points that the Board can be thinking about.

**Dr. Cathleen McHugh**, Chief Research Officer, Idaho State Board of Education reviewed the performance measures. The data shared focuses on student centered data where the student actually has to participate.

- The expectation is that the vast majority of students graduate from high school within 4 years. That is 95% of the goal, which is not being met. Graduation rate is steady at 80%.
- That rate further varies if you are male or female and if you're economically disadvantaged or not economically disadvantaged.
- if you're an economically disadvantaged male only one third of you will not graduate in 4 years.
- During Covid, when the graduation requirements were relaxed, for the economically disadvantaged males more of them graduated from high school. Therefore, research would need to be done to figure out which graduation requirement has been the stop gap in getting more of the males in this category to graduate.
- Another expectation is that the vast majority of Idaho students will be participating in advanced opportunities. And another that the majority of high school graduates are going to be ready for college as measured by the ACT and SAT. Unfortunately, they are not there yet, but the trend is improving.
- The benchmarks for the ACT and the SAT are the same. However, there's a selection effect for the ACT. Almost everybody takes the SAT, students **select** to take the ACT. The reason the ACT looks closer to the benchmark is because you're talking about a select group of students already.
- For advanced opportunities, some students participate to such a degree that they are graduating high school with a college degree, so that goal is being met, representing 3% of high school students graduating high school with their associate's degree.

**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

- After graduating from high school, the expectation is that undergraduates are going to complete 30 or more credits per academic year so that they're going to be on track to graduate on time.
- There is an expectation that a percentage of the degrees being conferred are STEM degrees.

Superintendent Critchfield said the data around the SAT / ACT testing was important. SDE has been reviewing who is taking the testing as they are both voluntary and more students seem to take the ACT over the SAT for various reasons. However, a discussion on this topic would be timely and would help SDE as they decide if Idaho needs to have a contract with both of them, which would negate the need for those students to use their dual credit money to pay for the ACT, because both tests will be paid for by the State.

Mr. Gilbert made a final comment saying that given the presentation on STEM and the gap between supply and demand, the Board should take a fresh look at the STEM targets to make sure they align with the data that we just saw in terms of what the gap is and how many degrees we need to produce. An examination of the performance measures as a whole is warranted.

**Briana Krebs**, Research Communications Specialist, Idaho State Board of Education, spoke about the college go-on rates. She shared the following. College-going rates are Idaho high school students who graduate from an Idaho public high school, and then enroll in a public post or postsecondary institution. This data is therefore only looking at students who manage to graduate from a public high school in Idaho.

There are two main data sources for college-going rates. The first is the national Student Clearing House, which provides data for institutions that are outside of the State of Idaho, as well as some private institutions inside the State of Idaho. And then there is direct data from Idaho's 8 public post-secondary institutions. However, 3% of schools do not submit data to the National Student Clearing House.

Other data shared;

- College-going rates have declined since 2018-19.
- A majority of students enrolled in postsecondary education within three years after high school graduation.
- Female college-going rates have been declining since 2016-17.
- Male enrollment rates are lower than females and have also declined since 2016-17.
- A majority of students scored proficient on the 10th grade English Language Arts ISAT.
- Less than half of students scored proficient on the 10th grade math ISAT.
- A majority of females score proficient on the 10th grade ISAT ELA assessment.
- Less than 40% of females score proficient on the 10th grade math assessment.

**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

- Fewer males score proficient on the English Language ISAT than females.
- Slightly more males score proficient on the math ISAT than females.
- High-achieving males are the most likely to delay college enrollment.
- The largest group of students who enrolled in college are those who are proficient in both subjects.
- Surprisingly, 25% or more of students who are not proficient in either subject are also enrolling in public postsecondary institutions.

Recap (The ISAT)

- Proficiency scores for the 10th grade ISAT are higher for English Language Arts than math.
- Females are more likely than males to perform well on the English Language Arts assessment.

Recap (College-Going Rates)

- Have declined since the onset of COVID-19.
- Are around 40% in the fall immediately after high school graduation.
- Are around 60% within three years after high school graduation.
- Are higher for females than for males and remain so three years after high school graduation.
- Are impacted by the highest achieving males delaying enrollment.

Superintendent Critchfield said that she sees many Hispanic males leaving high school due to a perceived advantage getting right into the workforce as early as possible, whether it's to help themselves or help their families. For many students, male and female, that drop out, they don't see the relevancy of what they're learning in high school as a connection to something to make them successful outside of that, and some just lose interest. This is a national issue in not enough males going onto higher education. Dr. McHugh added that when she first came to the Board office a peer mentoring program was in place that targeted male students and it was very affective. Statistically significant causal impact showed that if you had a young male who could mentor you through the process, you were more likely to go on. And that's exactly what the student body President from LCSC said yesterday.

Dr. Clark shared a little of her conversation with the student body presidents / vice-presidents who told her they are having a hard time in getting students to want to participate in campus events, they seem to prefer to sit alone with their headphones on. Other items brought forward are that national trends are showing that high school students are graduating without a driver's license; have never had a job or a pay check; have never dated, or gone to a school dance. And while these things are in decline, trends are showing anxiety, depression, addiction increasing among students all with an inadequate number of counselors in schools to help with this crisis. These are all issues that need to be discussed. As a Board, it is our responsibility to answer the

**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

question and define what students must know, understand what they need to be successful as they prepare to join the workforce.

**Cate Collins**, Senior Research Analyst, Idaho State Board of Education, talked about the Opportunity Scholarship program.

She shared the following;

- The Idaho opportunity scholarship includes the traditional component and the adult learner component, and both of them include an award amount of up to \$3,500 per year for up to 4 years, and that means Awardees can receive up to \$14,000 over their entire educational career.
- Awardees can pursue certificates, associate's degrees, and bachelor's degrees on their way to that first bachelor. The program is aimed at encouraging that bachelor's degree completion, but awardees can also obtain certificates and associates degrees along the way.
- Applicants have to have at least a 2.7 or higher GPA. They also need to have graduated or will graduate from an Idaho high school and have filled out their FAFSA application.
- Once those new applicants are awarded they then become renewals, and they can renew for the next 3 years. Renewal requirements are a bit different. They are required to communicate with the State Board Office that they intend to renew, they need to maintain that 2.7 GPA and earn at least 24 credits per year while they're on the award. This is hopefully ensuring they are on the path to finishing at least their bachelor's degree.
- The vast majority of awardees are those high school seniors getting ready to enroll immediately after high school graduation.
- The opportunity scholarship program allows for adult learners, people coming back into education to receive an award as show in the data.
- Sixty percent of Idaho applications have some sort of financial need and not all are Pell eligible.
- Statistical analysis shows that the probability a student will attend college increases 9 percentage points if they are offered the Opportunity Scholarship.
- Preliminary statistical analysis also shows that the probability a student graduates with a bachelor's degree within four years increases 8 percentage points if they are offered the Opportunity Scholarship.
- At least 71 percent of Opportunity Scholarship recipients who earn an associate or bachelor's degree are employed in Idaho after graduation.
- The award from the Opportunity Scholarship has not increased in 6 years which means it is not keeping pace with the cost of tuition, housing and books.

Superintendent Critchfield asked Mr. Freeman to clarify. Is there a fixed amount of appropriation awarded for the Opportunity Scholarship and what happens when the money runs out? Mr. Freeman said that was correct, there is approximately \$20 million

**BOARDWORK  
DECEMBER 13, 2023**

---

**DRAFT Minutes October 18-19, 2023**

dollars appropriated for the Opportunity Scholarship. With the advent of the LAUNCH program it is anticipated that more students will use that program for funding and applications for the Opportunity Scholarship will fall perhaps allowing for a higher award of monies in the Opportunity Scholarship than is currently being allocated.

Mr. Liebich asked if the Opportunity Scholarship was meeting the needs of Idaho students. Ms. Collins said there was actually a wait list this year and the anticipation is that there will be an even longer wait list next year. A future decision for the Board will be whether to increase the award amount and see what impact that might have on the program.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

***For a full recap of the data from the Research team see;  
<https://boardofed.idaho.gov/meetings/board/archive/2023/101823/06%20WORKSESSION.pdf>***

**INFORMATION ITEMS**

**PPGA**

1. Performance Measure Reports as Submitted to DFM for all Institutions and Agencies

**BOARD ACTION**

**Dr. Clark adjourned the meeting at 12:25 p.m. (PT).**

**BOARDWORK  
DECEMBER 13, 2023**

DRAFT Minutes November 13, 2023



**SPECIAL BOARD MEETING  
November 13, 2023  
OSBE Conference Room  
Suite 307  
Boise, ID 83720**

A special meeting of the Idaho State Board of Education was held at the offices of the Idaho State Board of Education on November 13, 2023. Board President Dr. Linda Clark called the meeting to order at 3:30 p.m. (MT).

**Present**

Dr. Linda Clark, President	Cindy Siddoway
William G. Gilbert, Vice-President	Cally Roach
Superintendent Critchfield, Secretary	
Kurt Liebich	

**Absent**

Dr. David Hill	Shawn Keough
----------------	--------------

**Monday, November 13, 2023 – 3:30 p.m. (Mountain Time)**

Mr. Liebich reminded the Board members that these rules were brought forward at the August Board meeting in draft form. Since that time, board staff has worked with the Governor's office as well as gone through the process of getting public comment on each of these rules which will need to be voted on today.

**PLANNING, POLICY AND GOVERNMENTAL AFFAIRS**

1. Pending Rule 08-0102-2301 – Postsecondary Credit Scholarship Program

Jenn Thompson, Chief Policy and Government Affairs Officer, Idaho State Board of Education, said this pending rule is related to governing the post-secondary credit scholarship program. This is actually a repeal of the entire rule. The rule itself only applied to new scholarship awards and the application process, and recent legislation ended the ability to award new scholarships in this category so the rule is no longer relevant so it's just being repealed in its entirety.

**BOARD ACTION**



**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

DRAFT Minutes November 13, 2023

**M/S (Liebich / Roach) I move to approve pending rule docket number 08-0102-2301, as submitted in Attachment 1.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 6-0. Shawn Keough and Dr. David Hill were absent from voting. There were no comments or questions from the Board.

2. Pending Rule 08-0113-2302 – Opportunity Scholarship

Ms. Thompson said proposed revisions to IDAPA 08.01.13 address various edits to aid in the streamlined implementation of the statewide scholarship, to accommodate for the impact of recent legislation, and to account for any future delays for when the Free Application for Federal Student Aid (FAFSA) can be submitted.

Other proposed amendments to the pending rule will streamline the language through the removal of any unnecessary language that duplicates language or provisions established through the agency's policies and procedures.

Specifically, scholarship recipients attending a community college who accepted or renewed an award offer on or before June 30, 2023, are eligible to renew their scholarship if the awardee has completed a minimum of 18 credit hours or its equivalent for each of the academic years the student received an opportunity scholarship. This change ensures that grant awards offered and accepted prior to the statutory change (effective July 1, 2023) will be administered as per the law in effect when the award was offered and accepted. This change holds students harmless. As the current law requires, and the rule reflects, no new awards may be granted to students for the purpose of attending a community college on or after July 1, 2023.

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Liebich / Critchfield) I move to approve pending rule – Docket 08-0113-2302, as submitted in Attachment 1.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 6-0. Shawn Keough and Dr. David Hill were absent from voting.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

3. Pending Rule 08-0203-2301 – Rules Governing Thoroughness

Ms. Thompson said amendments to the chapter are minimal and seek to remove duplicative language surrounding the satisfaction and engagement survey for alternative high schools. The duplicated language was identified by impacted stakeholders as having caused confusion. Survey requirements are outlined in the primary paragraph of section 112 of this rule. Reference to the same survey is not necessary to repeat in subsection 112.03.d., therefore it is proposed that the duplicative reference to the survey be removed.

**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

DRAFT Minutes November 13, 2023

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Liebich / Roach) I move to approve pending rule – Docket 08-0203-2301, as submitted in Attachment 1.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 6-0. Shawn Keough and Dr. David Hill were absent from voting.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

4. Pending Rule 08-0401-2301 – Idaho Digital Learning Academy (IDLA)

Ms. Thompson shared that the proposed revisions include primarily the removal of procedures from IDAPA that are more appropriately managed by the IDLA governing board and already exist in IDLA policy. Recommended deletions include items such as removal of the specific consequences for plagiarism (Subsection 102.02.b) and of the specific requirements for teacher interaction with students (Subsection 102.02.d). These requirements exist in policy established by the IDLA governing board. Removing these provisions from IDAPA places their governance at the local level but does not require any change to current practices.

The agency did not receive feedback during the final public comment period. No changes were made during the proposed and pending rule stages.

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Liebich / Siddoway) I move to approve pending rule – Docket Number 08-0401-2301, as submitted in Attachment 1.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 6-0. Shawn Keough and Dr. David Hill were absent from voting.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

5. Pending Rule Docket No. 55-0103-2301 – Career Technical Schools

Ms. Thompson said specific amendments to IDAPA 55.01.03 include technical changes such as updating the references from Career Technical Schools to Career Technical Centers and removing eligibility requirements that are already identified in Section 33-1002G, Idaho Code. More substantive changes include adding clarifying language identifying the process used for identifying student enrollment for reporting purposes for those who attend a career technical center charter school based on their residency within overlapping secondary school boundaries with the charter school attendance area, removing language around current career technical program requirements that apply to all approved career technical education programs and are therefore redundant in this rule, and removing specific funding distribution dates to allow for additional flexibility should all data be verified earlier allow for funds to be distributed earlier.

**BOARD ACTION**

**BOARDWORK**  
**DECEMBER 13, 2023**

DRAFT Minutes November 13, 2023

**M/S (Liebich / Gilbert) I move to approve pending rule Docket 55-0103-2301 as provided in Attachment 1.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 6-0. Shawn Keough and Dr. David Hill were absent from voting.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

6. Pending Rule – Docket No. 55-0104-2301, Rules Governing Idaho Quality Program Standards Incentive Grants and Agricultural Education Program Start-Up Grants

Ms. Thompson highlighted that specific amendment changes include, removing duplicative language and streamlining the application process; the uses of funds were expanded to include student travel cost for field trips and required student organization activities; and additional technical changes removing unnecessary definitions and updating terms. Additionally, the appeals section was removed, as it was determined to be unnecessary. The agency did not receive feedback during the final public comment period, therefore there were no changes made during the proposed and pending rule stages.

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Liebich / Gilbert) I move to approve pending rule Docket 55-0104-2301 as provided in Attachment 1.** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 6-0. Shawn Keough and Dr. David Hill were absent from voting.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

There being no further business a motion to adjourn was entertained.

**BOARD ACTION**

**M/S (Gilbert / Critchfield) I move to adjourn the meeting at 3:43 p.m. (MT).** A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 6-0. Shawn Keough and Dr. David Hill were absent from voting.